

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS PO Box 1430 Alexascin, Virginia 22313-1450 www.eapo.gov

| APPLICATION NO.   | FILING DATE | FIRST NAMED INVENTOR | ATTORNEY DOCKET NO. | CONFIRMATION NO. |
|---|-------------|----------------------|---------------------|------------------|
| 10/561,952  | 06/12/2006  | Sho Kumagai          | Q92253              | 3190             |
| 23373 7590 08/30/2010<br>SUGHRUE MION, PLLC<br>2100 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE, N.W. |             |                      | EXAMINER            |                  |
|   |             |                      | LANGMAN, JONATHAN C |                  |
| SUITE 800<br>WASHINGTON, DC 20037   |             | ART UNIT             | PAPER NUMBER        |                  |
|   |             |                      | 1784                |                  |
|   |             |                      |                     |                  |
|   |             |                      | NOTIFICATION DATE   | DELIVERY MODE    |
|   |             |                      | 08/30/2010          | ELECTRONIC       |

## Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Notice of the Office communication was sent electronically on above-indicated "Notification Date" to the following e-mail address(es):

sughrue@sughrue.com PPROCESSING@SUGHRUE.COM USPTO@SUGHRUE.COM Application/Control Number: 10/561,952

Art Unit: 1784

## ADVISORY ACTION

## Response to Arguments

Applicant argues on page 5 of the remarks submitted August 20, 2010, that Hotate teaches that the first coatings 2 have the same thickness of 100 microns (see col. 3, lines 50-51). Also, with regard to Hotate's teaching of sample 2, which is a single coating, Applicant submits that the mirror of Hotate's invention comprises a base, a first intermediate SiC coating, and a second SiC coating. The first coating 2 of a thickness of 30 microns is formed on the base 1 of Sample No. 2. After that, however, a second SiC coating 5 having a thickness of 130 microns is formed on the surface of portions 3 (see col. 3, lines 50-51). In other words, more than a single coating is provided. Accordingly, Applicant continues to submit that claim 1 is patentable over the cited references.

The examiner agrees that this embodiment at col. 3, lines 50-51, teaches multiple coatings with a first coating of 100 microns. However, "applicant must look to the whole reference for what it teaches. Applicant cannot merely rely on the examples and argue that the reference did not teach others." In re Courtright, 377 F.2d 647, 153 USPQ 735,739 (CCPA 1967).

The rejection set forth by the Examiner, is based on Hotate's teaching of sample 2, which is a single coating. The applicant is directed to Figures 3 and 4 which show a single polished coating, 3, on the base, 1. The applicants are directed to Hotate, col. 3, lines 28-30 which state "In samples no.1 to no. 5, a single SiC coating 2 is formed on the base 1"). As seen in table 1, the thickness of sample 2 is 30 microns. Hotate discloses that the upper surface of the first SiC coatings 2 are smoothed by polishing or

Application/Control Number: 10/561,952

Art Unit: 1784

lapping so that the surface 3 of the SiC coatings has a surface roughness of RMS 10 angstroms as shown in Figure 4 (col. 3, lines 21-25).

Although at col. 3, lines 50-51 Hotate teaches alternative embodiments that have multiple coatings, the applicant must consider all of the examples of Hotate, which, as described above, teach a single coating thereby reading on the claim as presented.

For reasons of record the rejections based on Hotate and Coppola or Otsuki and the rejections based on Hotate, Coppola or Otsuki in view of Wakugawa are maintained.

## Conclusion

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to JONATHAN C. LANGMAN whose telephone number is (571)272-4811. The examiner can normally be reached on Mon-Thurs 8:00 am - 6:30 pm EST.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Jennifer McNeil can be reached on 571-272-1540. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Application/Control Number: 10/561,952 Page 4

Art Unit: 1784

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

JCL

/Jennifer C. McNeil/ Supervisory Patent Examiner, Art Unit 1784